Human Emotion

Emotion and Morality
Are morals really just elaborated feelings?
Do emotions make us good?
Do emotions make us bad?
Roadmap

Course Logistics

Moral Emotion Families

Moral Brain?

The Good

The Bad

Take-Away Qs & Expert Interview
Course Logistics

Outreach Project Proposal Due
Roadmap

Course Logistics

Moral Emotion Families

Moral Brain?

The Good

The Bad

Take-Away Qs & Expert Interview
“Morality is therefore like the temple on the hill of human nature: It is our most sacred attribute, a trait that is often said to separate us from other animals and bring us closer to God.”

Jonathan Haidt
What is a Moral Emotion?

DEFINITION:
Those emotions that are linked to the interests or welfare of either society as a whole or people other than the agent.

Feature 1:
Disinterested Elicitors

Haidt (2003)
What is a Moral Emotion?

DEFINITION:
Those emotions that are linked to the interests or welfare of either society as a whole or people other than the agent.

Feature 2:
Prosocial Action Tendencies

Haidt (2003)
The diagram illustrates the relationship between the disinterestedness of elicitors and pro-social action tendency. The x-axis represents the disinterestedness of elicitors, ranging from self-interested to disinterested. The y-axis shows the pro-sociality of action tendency, ranging from low to high.

The diagram includes various emotions and their positions on the axis. For example, emotions such as fear, pride, daad, sadness, and happiness are positioned on the bottom left, indicating lower disinterestedness and lower pro-sociality. On the other hand, emotions like gratitude, shame, guilt, contempt, disgust, schadenfreude, elevation, and compassion are positioned on the top right, indicating higher disinterestedness and higher pro-sociality.

The diagram is labeled as per Haidt (2003).
Moral Emotion Families
Which emotions are moral?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TWO LARGE FAMILIES</th>
<th>TWO SMALLER FAMILIES</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other-condemning</td>
<td>Other-suffering</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Contempt, Anger,</td>
<td>Compassion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disgust</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Self-conscious</td>
<td>Other-praising</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>shame, embarrassment, guilt</td>
<td>gratitude and elevation</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Haidt (2003)
Moral Emotion Families
Which emotions are moral?

TWO LARGE FAMILIES

1. Other-condemning
   Contempt, Anger, Disgust

2. Self-conscious
   Shame, embarrassment, guilt

TWO SMALLER FAMILIES

1. Other-suffering
   Compassion

2. Other-praising
   Gratitude and elevation

Haidt (2003)
# Moral Emotion Families

## 1. Other-condemning: CAD Triad

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ELICITOR</th>
<th>ANGER</th>
<th>DISGUST</th>
<th>CONTEMPT</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Moral Emotion Families

### 1. Other-condemning: CAD Triad

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ELICITOR</th>
<th>ANGER</th>
<th>DISGUST</th>
<th>CONTEMPT</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Response to goal blockage or frustration</td>
<td>Response to unjustified insults, betrayal, and unfair treatment</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ACTION TENDENCY</td>
<td>Motivation to attack, humiliate, get <em>revenge</em> towards the person acting immorally</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Haidt, 2003; Rozin, Lowery, Imada, & Haidt, 1999
## Moral Emotion Families

### 1. Other-condemning: CAD Triad

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ELICITOR</th>
<th>ACTION TENDENCY</th>
<th>ANGER</th>
<th>DISGUST</th>
<th>CONTEMPT</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Response to goal blockage or frustration</td>
<td>I. Core disgust: Rejection system, usually food related, distaste response to food for both sensory and ideational properties (e.g., source of food)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Response to unjustified insults, betrayal, and unfair treatment</td>
<td>II. Expanded disgust: “guardian of temple of body” triggered by violation of cultural rules for how to use bodies (drugs, sex, etc). Also sociomoral disgust for social transgressions (cruelty, betrayal)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Motivation to attack, humiliate, get revenge towards the person acting immorally</td>
<td>Motivation to avoid, expel or break off contact with offending entity</td>
<td>Can include motivation to wash, purify or remove contact with entity</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Disgust as a Moral Emotion?

1. Disgust as a consequence of moral violations
   - **Claim**: Disgust is experienced as result of appraisal that moral violation has occurred, and in response to moral “purity” and “taboo” violations.
   - **Evidence**: People experience disgust in response to harmless moral violations (e.g., eating pet dog, having sex with a dead chicken). [Rozin et al., 1999]

2. Disgust as an amplifier of moral judgment
   - **Claim**: Disgust makes things seem even more wrong than they are.
   - **Evidence**: Inducing feelings of disgust makes people harsher judges of moral violations. [Wheatley & Haidt, 1999]

3. Disgust as a moralizing emotion
   - **Claim**: Morally neutral acts can become moral by virtue of being perceived as disgusting. Feeling of disgust itself is evidence that act is morally wrong.
   - **Evidence**: Disgust towards homosexual behavior may explain antigay moral attitudes (e.g., being gay is wrong, incest is wrong, neutral films). [Borg et al., 2008; Horberg et al., 2009; Inbar et al., 1999]
The Strange Politics of Disgust
TED talk: David Pizarro

### Moral Emotion Families

#### 1. Other-condemning: CAD Triad

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ELICITOR</th>
<th>ANGER</th>
<th>DISGUST</th>
<th>CONTEMPT</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Response to goal blockage or frustration</strong></td>
<td>Response to goal blockage or frustration</td>
<td>I. Core disgust: Rejection system, usually food related, distaste response to food for both sensory and ideational properties (e.g., source of food)</td>
<td>Looking down on someone, feeling morally superior</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Response to unjustified insults, betrayal, and unfair treatment</strong></td>
<td>II. Expanded disgust: “guardian of temple of body” triggered by violation of cultural rules for how to use bodies (drugs, sex, etc). Also sociomoral disgust for social transgressions (cruelty, betrayal)</td>
<td>Perceiving that another person does not measure up</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Motivation to attack, humiliate, get revenge towards the person acting immorally</strong></td>
<td>Motivation to avoid, expel or break off contact with offending entity</td>
<td>Social cognitive change</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Can include motivation to wash, purify or remove contact with entity</td>
<td>Treat other with less warmth, respect and consideration</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

CAD Triad Hypothesis

1. **Community**: disrespect and violations of duty or hierarchy (*contempt*)

2. **Autonomy**: violations of rights and fairness (*anger*)

3. **Divinity**: violations of physical purity, such as food and sex taboos (*disgust*)

Rozin, Lowery, Imada, & Haidt, 1999
Moral Emotion Families
Which emotions are moral?

TWO LARGE FAMILIES
1. Other-condemning
   Contempt, Anger, Disgust
2. Self-conscious
   shame, embarrassment, guilt

TWO SMALLER FAMILIES
1. Other-suffering
   Compassion
2. Other-praising
   gratitude and elevation

Haidt (2003)
Moral Emotion Families

Which emotions are moral?

**TWO LARGE FAMILIES**

1. Other-condemning
   Contempt, Anger, Disgust

2. Self-conscious
   shame, embarrassment, guilt

**TWO SMALLER FAMILIES**

1. Other-suffering
   Compassion

2. Other-praising
   gratitude and elevation

Haidt (2003)
### Characteristics of Shame

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Elicitor</th>
<th>Behavior</th>
<th>Consequence</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Negative evaluation of self  
(e.g., “I’m a thief”) | Hunched over posture, retreat or hide from social group  
(e.g., “hide!”) | Less likely to take corrective action |
### Characteristics of Embarrassment

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Elicitor</th>
<th>Behavior</th>
<th>Consequence</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Violate social conventions or norms</td>
<td>Acknowledge mistake, remedy social transgressions, repair relationships</td>
<td>Forgiveness, Laughter, Liking, Trust</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Keltner & Anderson (2000)
## Characteristics of Guilt

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Elicitor</th>
<th>Behavior</th>
<th>Consequence</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Negative evaluation of action (e.g., “I can’t believe I stole that”)</td>
<td>Negative emotion towards target</td>
<td>Can motivate behavior to address problem (e.g., return stolen item)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Moving/action to address problem</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Self-Conscious Emotions
How are shame, embarrassment, & guilt moral?

SHAME
Protoshame: non-moral (how one should act)
Moral shame: violating a norm and knowing that someone else knows about the violation (how one should be). There is a defect in one’s core self (appraise oneself as bad).

EMBARRASSMENT
Elicited by appraisals of one’s social identity or persona as damaged or threatened.

GUILT
Violation of moral rules and imperatives, especially if caused harm or suffering to others. Appraise one’s actions as bad.
Moral Emotion Families

Which emotions are moral?

TWO LARGE FAMILIES

1. Other-condemning
   Contempt, Anger, Disgust

2. Self-conscious
   shame, embarrassment, guilt

TWO SMALLER FAMILIES

1. Other-suffering
   Compassion

2. Other-praising
   gratitude and elevation

Haidt (2003)
Roadmap

Course Logistics
Moral Emotion Families
Moral Brain?
The Good
The Bad
Take-Away Qs & Expert Interview
An fMRI Investigation of Emotional Engagement in Moral Judgment

Joshua D. Green

The long-standing rationalist tradition in moral psychology emphasizes the role of reason in moral judgment. A more recent trend places increased emphasis on emotion. Although both reason and emotion are likely to play important roles in moral judgment, relatively little is known about their neural correlates, the nature of their interaction, and the factors that modulate their respective behavioral influences in the context of moral judgment. In two functional magnetic resonance imaging (fMRI) studies using moral dilemmas as probes, we apply the methods of cognitive neuroscience to the study of moral judgment. We argue that moral dilemmas vary systematically in the extent to which they engage emotional processing and that these variations in emotional engagement influence moral judgment. These results may shed light on some puzzling patterns in moral judgment observed by contemporary philosophers.
Joshua Greene

MORAL TRIBES
EMOTION, REASON, AND
THE GAP BETWEEN US AND THEM

JOSHUA GREENE
“Reason is and ought only to be the slave of the passions, and can never pretend to be any other office than to serve and obey them”

- Hume (1739/1969)
Roadmap

Course Logistics

Moral Emotion Families

Moral Brain?

The Good

The Bad

Take-Away Qs & Expert Interview
Emotions make us good?
THE GOOD?
Compassion, Gratitude, & Elevation
The Good - Compassion, Gratitude, & Elevation
The Good - Compassion, Gratitude, & Elevation
Moral Emotion Families
Which emotions are moral?

TWO LARGE FAMILIES
1. Other-condemning
   Contempt, Anger, Disgust
2. Self-conscious
   shame, embarrassment, guilt

TWO SMALLER FAMILIES
1. Other-suffering
   Compassion
2. Other-praising
   gratitude and elevation

Haidt (2003)
Sympathy “will have been increased through natural selection; for those communities, which included the greatest number of the most sympathetic members, would flourish best, and rear the greatest number of offspring”

- Darwin, 1871/2004, p.130
“When we see a stroke aimed, and just ready to fall upon the leg or arm of another person, we naturally shrink and draw back our own leg or our arm, and when it does fall, we feel it in some measure, and are hurt by it as well as the sufferer.”

-Adam Smith
What is Compassion?
Compassion is....

“...the experience of feelings, chiefly emotions, similar in kind to those expressed by or known to exist in another person. It...sets aside our own personality, and moves us to partake of the pleasure or pain, the happiness or misery, of others.”

(Davis, 1900)
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ELICITOR</th>
<th>Perception of another suffering or distressed</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ACTION TENDENCY</td>
<td>Help, comfort or alleviate suffering of the other</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Participants asked to feel empathy OR asked to be objective.

Empathy leads to greater concern and greater helping.

Daniel Batson
Compassion in Early Life

From birth to 14 months infants will react with distress to cries of other infants.

After first year, the distress of others will lead to helping behaviors.
Compassion Across Species

Albino rat distressed—suspended in midair. Fellow rat will press lever to lower him/her.

Rhesus monkeys press bar to receive food reward (large or small). Large reward causes electric shocks for another monkey. Most monkeys will stop pressing bar for large reward.
The Good - Compassion, Gratitude, & Elevation
Moral Emotion Families
Which emotions are moral?

TWO LARGE FAMILIES
1. Other-condemning
   Contempt, Anger, Disgust
2. Self-conscious
   shame, embarrassment, guilt

TWO SMALLER FAMILIES
1. Other-suffering
   Compassion
2. Other-praising
   gratitude and elevation

Haidt (2003)
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ELICITOR</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Perception that another person has done a good deed for the self (intentionally or voluntarily)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ACTION TENDENCY</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Moral motive, makes people act more prosocially and help others</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Gratitude is Healthy
Michael McCullough

- Increased gratitude not only benefits those who are the recipients

- Greater feelings of gratitude enhance resilience, physical health, and quality of life

- Focus on “gratitude interventions” to promote psychological well-being

Emmons & McCullough, 2003; McCullough et al., 2001
Other-Praising Family
Gratitude & Elevation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ELICITOR</th>
<th>GRATITUDE</th>
<th>ELEVATION</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Perception that another person has done a good deed for the self (intentionally or voluntarily)</td>
<td>Experiences larger than the self (beauty, art, nature, exceptional actions/abilities)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ACTION TENDENCY</td>
<td>Moral motive, makes people act more prosocially and help others</td>
<td>Motivate one to become a better person</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Haidt & Keltner, 1999; Haidt et al., 2002; McCullough et al. (2001)
Elevation

Jonathan Haidt

- Participants recalled a “manifestation of humanity’s higher or better nature.”

- Report warm, pleasant, tingling feelings in chest

- Attention turned outwards and help others
“Reason is and ought only to be the slave of the passions, and can never pretend to be any other office than to serve and obey them”

- Hume (1739/1969)
“Morality is therefore like the temple on the hill of human nature: It is our most sacred attribute, a trait that is often said to separate us from other animals and bring us closer to God.”

Jonathan Haidt
Psychopathy: Lack of Compassion & Empathy?

"I mean, there are so many people"

Ted Bundy
Roadmap

Course Logistics
Moral Emotion Families
Moral Brain?
The Good
The Bad
Take-Away Qs & Expert Interview
THE BAD?

Psychopathy
Special Guest Lecture

Dr. Joshua Buckholtz

Assistant Professor of Psychology
Harvard University

Emotion and Psychopathy
Roadmap

- Course Logistics
- Moral Emotion Families
- Moral Brain?
- The Good
- The Bad

Take-Away Qs & Expert Interview
Experts In Emotion Interview

Dr. Jonathan Haidt

Thomas Cooley Professor of Ethical Leadership
Stern School of Business
New York University

Morality and emotion
Experts In Emotion
Interview
Dr. David Pizarro
Associate Professor of Psychology
Cornell University

Morality and disgust
Experts In Emotion Interview

Dr. Steven Pinker

Harvard College Professor
Johnstone Family Professor of Psychology
Harvard University

Violence and emotion
Thank You!